Explaining rationale exercise

Choose an introduction or specific aims page. It may be easier to critique someone else’s writing, but using your own may be more helpful. If you use part of someone else’s proposal, obtain their explicit permission to use it and remove their name and all identifying information from the document you submit.

Submit the section itself as a Word document, using the comment function to indicate:

1) the research question
2) the unknown
3) the important problem

If any of these are missing, indicate where they should be and suggest possible explanations.

Critique the section:

1) How well does the question correspond to the conclusion or aims? How could you make it clearer or more specific?
2) How clearly does it explain why the research is important? How do the authors make this case? How would you improve this argument to make the research seem more exciting?
3) How well do the authors explain the relationship between why the work is important and the specific thing they studied/ will study? How could this explanation be made clearer?
4) What else is in the section besides the question, the importance, and how the two are related? How does this other material affect the way you interpret the paper or proposal as a whole? What would you do with this material if you were to revise the section and why?